



Accelerating Caribbean Internet Development

INTRODUCTION

The Caribbean Telecommunications Union's (CTU) 12th Caribbean Internet Governance Forum (CIGF), took place from the **10th to 12th August, 2016**, at the Radisson Fort George Hotel and Marina in Belize City, Belize. The forum was hosted by the Public Utilities Commission (PUC) of Belize.

The Caribbean Internet Governance Forum (CIGF) is a regional, multi-stakeholder forum initiated by the Caribbean Telecommunications Union and the Caribbean Community (CARICOM) Secretariat in 2005 to coordinate a regional approach to Internet Governance. The forum has since met annually and has delivered significant and pioneering benefits to the region as well as to the global Internet community, contributing significantly to deepening Caribbean stakeholders' understanding of Internet Governance issues, structures, processes and their implications for the region.

The 12th CIGF focused on accelerating Internet development in the Caribbean. It addressed areas of high priority, including cybersecurity, data protection, IPv6 transition and net neutrality. There was also special focus on developing a tool kit for establishing national structures to support the work of the CIGF and on continuing the work of policy development, through finalization of Issue 3.0 of the Caribbean Internet Governance Policy Framework.

SUMMARY OF FORUM PROCEEDINGS

The 12th CIGF saw participation from some fifty registrants from 9 countries; twenty-six were from outside of Belize. There was also remote participation from Barbados remote hub, Trinidad and Tobago, representatives of the global Internet Governance Forum (UN) and Google. Participants came from the Government, private sector, civil society and academia stakeholder groups including representatives of major global and regional Internet organisations. The list of registered participants is given in Appendix 3.

The final programme of the 12th CIGF is given in Appendix 2. The first day focused on capacity building sessions to bring newcomers and more experienced participants alike up to comparable levels of knowledge on Internet terminology, technology and policy issues. The Hon. Vanessa Retreage, Attorney General and Minister of Natural Resources of Belize, was in attendance. The second and third days addressed substantive discussion of the theme and various Internet "hot topics". The workshop activity on Day 2 engaged the participants in a review of the draft Issue 3.0 of the CIGPF and later on Day 3 in three work groups towards developing a toolkit for fostering national multi-stakeholder fora in the Caribbean. The output objective of this latter workshop included general guidelines and/or alternative approaches for engaging and motivating individuals and organisations to form, sustain and participate in Internet Governance multi-stakeholder groups.

The outputs of these workshops would be subject to wider comments and used to guide future regional progress of the various specific items.

OBJECTIVES OF 12th CIGF

The forum addressed the following objectives via a series of presentation, discussion and workshop sessions, led or facilitated by respected regional or international specialists and practitioners:

- Facilitate open discussion on current Internet governance matters of global interest e.g. ICANN transition, net neutrality etc.
- Develop strategies and approaches for building and/or strengthening national multi-stakeholder structures to enhance Internet governance capacity, expertise and action in the Caribbean
- Explore and spread awareness on opportunities for Caribbean growth through the Internet Economy
- Build local capacity in Internet governance to enable, maintain and strengthen effective Caribbean representation at global Internet Governance Fora
- Conclude review and update of the Caribbean Internet Governance Policy Framework V 2.0

KEY OUTCOMES

12 th CIGF OBJECTIVES	OUTCOME
Facilitate open discussion on current Internet governance matters of global interest e.g. ICANN transition, net neutrality etc.	Addressed in specific presentations followed by open discussions by participants as issues were raised on OTT, Net Neutrality and other fundamental Internet Governance matters.
Develop strategies and approaches for building and/or strengthening national multi-stakeholder structures to enhance Internet governance capacity, expertise and action in the Caribbean	Via group workshop activity, approaches identified/recommended for further evaluation for developing multi-stakeholder Internet governance groups/structures at the national level in the Caribbean and for the terms of reference of such groups. Possible target groups should include ISOC Chapters, IT Associates, Computer Societies, Business Associates, Government ICT Ministries, Academia, Individuals and Corporations (ICT sector). Output notes from the workshop groups are given in Appendix 1.
Explore and spread awareness on opportunities for Caribbean growth through the Internet Economy	To be fostered via the CIGF, the Caribbean ICT Road show which has been very successful and will continue, workshops, seminars, Ministerial briefings and publications.

Build local capacity in Internet governance to enable, maintain and strengthen effective Caribbean representation at global Internet Governance Fora	Achieved through the Day 1 programme and the discussions, collaborations and workshops of Days 2 and 3. The CTU will continue to foster collaboration in the Caribbean region on Internet issues and in particular through the medium of the CIGF. More deliberate efforts will continue to be taken in future to coordinate the work of the CIGF with the wider regional and global IGFs.
Conclude review and update of the Caribbean Internet Governance Policy Framework V 2.0	Open session reviewed the text of draft Caribbean Internet Governance Policy Framework V3.0 and recommended minor inputs and revisions. Version 3.0 was anticipated to be issued in early 2017.

FOLLOW-UP ACTION ACTIVITIES

1. Review and follow-up on participants' evaluation and workshop recommendations from the 12th Caribbean Internet Governance Forum.
2. Issuance of V 3.0 and further updating of the Caribbean Internet Governance Policy Framework along with continued follow-up on its various policy recommendations by identified actors.
3. Capacity building in Internet Governance in the Caribbean through reputable Internet Organisations.
4. Sensitise and educate the general public on the importance of Internet Governance.
5. Developing a Toolkit for fostering national multi-stakeholder fora in the Caribbean. The following guidelines should be considered:
 - **Set your Goals.** What do you want your National IG to achieve? What are the key national IG priorities or issues to be addressed?
 - **Establish Your Core Resources.** Need a strong, committed team, finances and action plan to get things going. Decide who will be responsible for tasks, and what are the timeframes for your project?
 - **Identify Roles and Responsibilities.**
 - **Define Your Governance Structure.** How to plan and manage operations and be accountable within the management team and external stakeholders.
 - **Develop an Engagement Strategy.** What are the options for reaching your target audiences.
 - **Build Your Support Network.** Identify organisations and individuals who will be able to assist you in raising funds, promoting programmes, organizing events and developing contents.
 - **Develop an Operations and Administration Framework.** Define guidelines for membership, participation, meeting organization, managing finances, etc.

Appendix 1 – Work Group Output Notes

Output Objectives: General guidelines and/or alternative approaches for engaging and motivating individuals and organisations to form and participate in Internet Governance multi-stakeholder groups.

GROUP #1	<p>Ashell Forde Sean Alamilla Christopher Hudson Juliet Best-Brathwaite Winston Devonish Sonia Burns Isaf Ali Ian Campbell John Avery Jaime Bautista</p>
1. Engagement of Policy Makers/Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lobbying for support (Need to show the regulators that there is an advantage to the consumers) • Take advantage of Government activities (have a representative or a councilor on site) • Group coincides with Government development plans to creatively influence all parties • Government and regulator will react to public pressure • Need to include best practice from other IGF agencies • The Multi-stakeholder group needs to be visibly representative of the various workgroup
2. Participate in global and regional IGF and other areas of community interest.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Avoid local IGF becoming stagnated or an echo chamber by being involved in other forums with varying interest • Get ideas for diverse topics from other meetings/events, e.g. Forum for youth groups and entrepreneurs • Network with colleagues in other internet governance spheres
3. PR Campaign and Education Component	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Media Houses • Social Media <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Info-graphic ➤ Posters • Get the NGOs involved and participate in forums that discuss the issues that they are facing • Leveraging NGOs and special interest groups • Road Shows • Story telling <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Privacy rights ➤ Electronic ➤ Volunteers ➤ How to engage • Information source group

4. Funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government Agencies (offer space free of charge, help with the ground work, grants) • Charge a consultant fee for training or research services (qualified technicians) • Donations and grants from IGF sectarian • Assignment of USF • Specific taxes
5. Stakeholder representation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure maximum stakeholder engagement • Looking at all the organizations that would benefit from this initiative • Continual assessment of stakeholder representation • Stakeholder group to decide on who should represent group

GROUP #2	<table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; border: none;">Etienne Sharp Angela Palacio Hugo Vasquez Andy Martinez</td> <td style="width: 50%; border: none;">Sharri Sampson Leo Sanchez Solangel Vasquez Kimberly Wallace</td> </tr> </table>	Etienne Sharp Angela Palacio Hugo Vasquez Andy Martinez	Sharri Sampson Leo Sanchez Solangel Vasquez Kimberly Wallace
Etienne Sharp Angela Palacio Hugo Vasquez Andy Martinez	Sharri Sampson Leo Sanchez Solangel Vasquez Kimberly Wallace		
1. Government of Belize (to be targeted)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ministry of Education • Belipo (Intellectual property) • BAHU • FIU • Health Sector 		
2. Educational Institution (to be targeted)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • University of Belize • Galen University • Private tertiary institution 		
3. NGO (to be targeted)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UNDP • PAHO • TIDE • UNICEF • NGC 		
4. Private Sector (to be targeted)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chamber of Commerce • Minnonites Business Community • San Pedro Chamber of Commerce • Toledo Association of Business • BLPA 		

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BTIA • Bankers Association • Belipo (Intellectual Property)
5. Interested Stakeholders (to be targeted)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ISP • Telecom Licenses • Newly formed Belize ITC Professional Association • Regulator (PUC)
6. Judicial System (to be targeted)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bar Association
7. Medium of communication	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internet • Media • Social Media • Radio • Television • Working Groups
8. How to engage the public of Internet Governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incentivize by showing the importance of Internet Governance • Sensitize/educate about the importance of Internet • Positive enforcement/success story • Soliciting Public Input <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Town Hall meetings ➤ Setup website to facilitate concerns ➤ Dropbox centre • Road Show
9. Planting a seed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explaining what is Internet Governance • Is it beneficial? Benefits would be having access to information and increasing knowledge

GROUP #3	Namrita Balani Errol Noralez Calton Samuels Kevon Swift Roosevelt Blades Jason Hynds Sean Fouche Victor Lewis Jacqueline Morris
1. Setting the principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Call for participation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Various stakeholder groups ➤ Open call for reasonable timeframe ➤ F2F contacts ➤ Utilize all channels ➤ Limit – expression of interest survey • What is the aim?
2. Planning and control to organize event	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Who makes the call is important, neutral but influential • Select a chairperson • Granular survey for interested people • Data analysis – topics for forum • Basic principle – openness • Building awareness via smaller events • Forum is not a place for experts. We want curious persons
3. Organizational Aspect	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Different ways to run the committee/work Group • Working Group templete: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Terms of reference ➤ Criteria for members to work ➤ Number of members ➤ Number of Stakeholder Groups differ from country to country
4. Guiding Principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capture of the group. Finalize number of members per group.
5. Financial Independence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fund (Trust) – Sustainability • Commercial activity – statistics & reports
6. Strong Moderator	
7. Combination of methods to choose members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Representative from stakeholders • Self-nominated by open call
8. Open travel support programme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National Stakeholder issues to foster interest – connect to personal • Achievement is recognized • Short term gains • Outreach in their area • Capacity building via training



Programme
Wednesday 10th August, 2016
Plenary



Time	Technical or Tutorial Session	Presenter
08:00	Registration	
08:30	Call to Order and Invocation	Master of Ceremonies
08:35	Opening Remarks	Mr. John Avery Chairman – Public Utilities Commission, Belize
08:45	The ABCs of Internet Governance: - Internet Lingo Demystified	Mr Bevil Wooding Internet Strategist Packet Clearing House
09:20	Internet Domains Explained aka How the Internet Really Works	Mr. Albert Daniels Senior Manager, Stakeholder Engagement for the Caribbean ICANN
10:00	Break	
10:30	Security and Privacy Issues in Internet of Things (IoT) Applications	Mr. Shernon Osepa Manager, Regional Affairs - Latin America & the Caribbean, Internet Society (ISOC)
11:00	IPv6: Transition Status, Imperatives and Stakeholder Strategies	Mr. John Curran President & Chief Executive Officer American Registry for Internet Numbers (ARIN)
12:00	Lunch	
13:00	A Fair, Balanced and Nuanced Assessment of Network Neutrality	Prof. Robert Frieden Pioneer’s Chair and Professor of Telecommunications and Law PENN STATE UNIVERSITY
14:00	Data Protection Overview: Regimes, Best Practices and Caribbean Experiences Discussion	Ms. Sharmie Farrington-Austin Consultant (Former Bahamas Data Commissioner)
15:00	Break	
15:30	CIRTs 101 and the Need for Regional Collaboration	Mr. Sean Fouché Information Technology Manager CARICOM IMPACS
16:30	Discussion	
17:00	End of Day 1	

Programme

Thursday 11th August, 2016

Opening Ceremony

Time	Plenary	Presenter
08:00	Registration	
09:00	Call to Order and Invocation	Master of Ceremonies
09:05	Introduction to the 12 th CIGF	Mr. Gary Kalloo - CTU
09:10	Opening Remarks (via Web Conference Link)	Ms. Bernadette Lewis Secretary General Caribbean Telecommunications Union
09:20	Remarks	Mr. John Curran Chief Executive Officer American Registry for Internet Numbers
09:25	Remarks	Mr. Bevil Wooding Caribbean Outreach Manager / Internet Strategist Packet Clearing House
09:30	Remarks	Mr. Albert Daniels Senior Manager, Stakeholder Engagement for the Caribbean ICANN
09:35	Remarks	Mr. Kevon Swift Caribbean Representative LACNIC
09:40	Remarks	Ms. Maria-Cristina Capelo Public Policy and Government Relations Google
09:45	Remarks (via Web Conference Link)	Ms. Lynn St. Amour Chair – Multi-stakeholder Advisory Group Internet Governance Forum (UN)
09:50	Welcome Remarks	Mr. John Avery Chairman – Public Utilities Commission, Belize
10:00	CIGF @ 12 : What We've Done, Current Initiatives and What's Next	Mr. Nigel Cassimire Telecommunications Specialist Caribbean Telecommunications Union
10:30	Vote of Thanks	Master of Ceremonies
	Coffee Break	

Programme

Thursday 11th August, 2016

Time	Plenary	Presenter
11:00	Panel Discussion: Is there an issue with net neutrality in the Caribbean and is any action required by relevant stakeholders on this matter?	Moderator: - Prof. Rob Frieden – Penn State University - Ms. Maria-Cristina Capello – Google - [Belizean panellist]
12:00	Lunch	
	Building Caribbean Capacity for Accelerating the Caribbean Internet Economy	
13:00	Presentation: Developing an Internet Exchange Point in Belize to Accelerate the Local Internet Economy	Mr. Etienne Sharp Belize IT Association
14:00	Panel Discussion: Are local IXPs having the desired impact in the Caribbean?	Moderator: Mr. Bevil Wooding - Mr. Etienne Sharp - CaribTLD Member/Rep -
14:30	Coffee Break	
15:00	Workshop: Identified Areas for Update of the Caribbean IG Policy Framework	Mr. Nigel Cassimire CTU
	Plenary Discussion: Consensus building	
16:30	Wrap-Up	
	End of Day 2 Session	
17:30	Cocktail Reception	

Programme

Friday 12th August, 2016

Time	Session	Presenter
08:55	Introduction	Master of Ceremonies
09:00	ICANN Issues Update: Status , Prognosis and Opportunities for Caribbean Contribution	Mr. Albert Daniels Senior Manager, Stakeholder Engagement for the Caribbean ICANN
09:30	General Discussion of Caribbean Participation in ICANN Communities: GAC, ALAC, gNSO, ccNSO etc.	Moderator: Mr. Albert Daniels All Participants
10:00	Regional and Global IGF Activities and Leveraging Interrelationships with Other IG Fora in the Region and Internationally: Building Caribbean Influence	Moderator: Mr. Kevon Swift
10:15	Q&A / Discussion	
10:30	Coffee Break	
11:00	Case Studies of National Multi-stakeholder Initiatives - TT MAG - Barbados MAG	Mr. Carlton Samuels – Moderator Ms. Jacqueline Morris – TT MAG Mr. Jason Hynds – P.a.R.T.S Inc.
12:00	Lunch	
13:00	Workshop Session: Developing a Toolkit for Fostering National Multi-stakeholder Fora in the Caribbean	CTU
14:15	Coffee Break	
14:30	Presentations of Workshop Recommendations	Working Group Spokespersons
15:30	Open Microphone	All
16:00	Wrap Up	CTU
16:30	End of Forum	

Appendix #3

12th CIGF - REGISTRATION

Last Name	First Name	Organisation	Stakeholder Group
Ali	Isaf	Telecommunications Authority of T & T	Gov't
Alamilla	Sean	Public Utilities Commission – Belize	Gov't
Avery	John	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Balani	Namrita	Ministry of Education - Belize	Gov't
Barrow	Anwar	Belize Telemedia Limited	Private Sector
Barrow	Justin	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Barrow	Kimano	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Bautista	Jaime	University Management Limited Belize	Academia
Best-Brathwaite	Juliet	Cable & Wireless (Barbados) Ltd	Private Sector
Blades	Roosevelt	Independent	Civil Society
Burns	Sonia	Belize Water Services Limited	Private Sector
Campbell	Ian	CTU	Gov't
Carrillo	Nubia	Speednet	Private Sector
Cassimire	Nigel	CTU	Gov't
Cattouse	Errol	Belize Internet Exchange Point	Internet Org.
Curran	John	ARIN	Internet Org.
Daniels	Albert	ICANN	Internet Org.
Devonish	Winston	Government of Barbados	Gov't
Dougal	Sharolyn	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Douglas	Sonja	Telecommunications Authority of T & T	Regulator
Edenjie	Melvyn	Statistical Institute of Belize	Private Sector
Farrington - Austin	Sharmie	Consultant	Civil Society
Forde	Ashell	Telecommunications Unit - Barbados	Gov't
Fouche	Sean	CARICOM IMPACS	Gov't
Fraser	Kevin	Telecommunications Authority of T & T	Regulator

Last Name	First Name	Organisation	Stakeholder Group
Frieden	Robert	Penn State University	Academia
Godoy	Wayne	University of Belize	Academia
Hudson	Christopher	Central TV & Internet - Belize	Private Sector
Hynds	Jason	P.A.R.T.S. Inc.	Internet Org.
Jones	Bartholomew	Belize Police Department	Gov't
Kaloo	Gary	CTU	Gov't
Lewis	C. Victor	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Lucas	Harris	Belize Telemedia Limited	Private Sector
Martinez	Andy	Alliance IP	Private Sector
McKnight	Glenn	ICANN NARALO	Internet Org.
Morris	Jacqueline	University of Trinidad and Tobago	Academia
Noralez	Errol	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Osepa	Shernon	ISOC	Internet Org.
Palacio	Angela	Private (Independent)	Private Sector
Retreage	Hon. Vanessa	Attorney General - Belize	Gov't
Rosado	Javier	University of Belize	Academia
Sampson	Sharry	Belize Chamber of Commerce & Industry	Gov't
Samuels	Carlton	The University of the West Indies	Academia
Sanchez	Leonides	Private (Independent)	Private Sector
Sharp	Etienne	Belize Cloud Services	Private Sector
Swift	Kevon	LACNIC	Internet Org.
Vasquez	Hugo	Stellar Links - Belize	Private Sector
Vasquez	Solangel	Stellar Links - Belize	Private Sector
Wallace	Kimberly	Public Utilities Commission - Belize	Gov't
Wooding	Bevil	Packet Clearing House	Internet Society